

The last contribution, in which Zoë Opačić uncovers how medieval Prague became the stage for Christian ceremony, deserves our special attention. The topography of Prague was meant to have a theological influence on its visitors, so that they could be mentally and spiritually transformed. Therefore, Prague became a city of liturgy and ceremony, a kind of heaven on earth. The book does not end with a general conclusion, which is not a bad thing given the variety of the contributions.

H. GEYBELS

Vincent PETIT. *Église et nation: La question liturgique en France au XIX^e siècle* (Histoire). Rennes, Presses universitaires de Rennes, 2010. (15,5×24), 199 p. ISBN 978-2-7535-1014-2. €18.00.

Issu d'une thèse en histoire soutenue à l'Université de Rennes en 2008, cet ouvrage est la présentation détaillée du passage des diocèses français de leur liturgie propre à la liturgie romaine en très peu d'années. La décennie 1850-1860 est décisive et la plupart des rites diocésains multi-centenaires disparaissent, emportés par une vague ultramontaine. Vincent Petit fait clairement comprendre le rôle de Dom Prosper Guéranger dans ce processus, en harmonie avec une tendance ecclésiale plus large que ce phénomène concernant la liturgie. L'historien expose et analyse de nombreux documents, des écrits de la base (prêtres) aux documents romains, concernant cet «affrontement» entre tendance gallicane et tendance ultramontaine naissante. La liste des imprimés de 1830 à 1874 retenus dans la recherche (p. 183-189) montre l'acuité de la question liturgique au milieu du siècle. Ce travail d'historien est précieux. Il permet d'éviter toute lecture romantique de l'œuvre de Dom Guéranger. Il aide aussi à percevoir l'immédiate préhistoire du mouvement liturgique et par là de comprendre plusieurs orientations majeures de ce dernier dès ses débuts.

A. JOIN-LAMBERT

Sarah Hinlicky WILSON. *Woman, Women, and the Priesthood in the Trinitarian Theology of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel*. London, T&T Clark, 2013. (23×15), VIII-200 p. ISBN 978-0-5670-6110-2. \$100.54.

It has been repeatedly emphasized by Eastern theologians that the debates about the ordination of the women to priesthood in their Church have been the result of external influences and pressures rather than an initiative which has naturally sprung out of the Orthodox *milieu*. Challenging such a long-held assumption, the reworked dissertation of Sarah Hinlicky Wilson, published under the title *Woman, Women, and the Priesthood in the Trinitarian Theology of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel*, provides readers with an outstanding inquiry into the vocation of women as it has been theologically portrayed by one of the most important Orthodox thinkers. Shedding light upon Elisabeth Behr-Sigel's theology, the present book revisits her irenic call for rethinking the possibility of women's ordination as an endeavor "generated from within, a result of her immersion in the Scripture, the church

fathers, and the theology of the Orthodox church, occasioned but not determined by changes in the status of women in worldly society" (p. vii).

Divided in eight chapters, the book of S.H. Wilson not only successfully succeeds to systematize the progressive stages of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel's advocacy of women's ordination, but it also manages to present her theology as an ongoing dialogue with different modern Orthodox theologians, whose reluctance to accept the ministry of women are based on arguments that are patristically and theologically objectionable: Christ's maleness, a gender-based distribution of charisms, and an exaltation of feminine values on the basis of the relation between Mary and women.

While the first chapter of S.H. Wilson's book contains elements of biography that provide a brief description of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel's educational journey, academic career and ecumenical engagement, the second chapter focuses upon Paul Evdokimov's understanding of the role of the women in the Church, as the initial impulse that has determined and largely influenced her first reflections about women and priesthood. Evdokimov's theology constitutes the first consistent Orthodox approach to the issue of women's role in the Church, highlighting the fact that the differences between women and men have a transcendental source. According to the Russian theologian, the ontologically grounded differences between womanhood and manhood should not be seen as a source of conflict, but rather as two complementary aspects, each of them having their own charisms and tasks. Consequently, Evdokimov not only asserts that the Mother of God's maternity and chastity reveal women's vocation, but he goes even further and points out that in the Trinity the Holy Spirit is hypostatic motherhood. While in the Church human females are the bearer of a charismatic or pneumatic ministry, human males are entitled to exercise a Christ-like or institutional ministry. Any attempt of women to fulfill an institutional ministry would inevitably undermine their unique vocation. Elisabeth Behr-Sigel's first reflections on womanhood follow closely Evdokimov's intuitions, but then, as the next three chapters emphasize, she became progressively more critical of most theologians inclined to defend male-only priesthood on the basis of such assumptions. Although the international gathering for Orthodox women at the Agapia monastery in Romania (September 1976) reveals her as entirely guided by the Russian theologian's thinking, in the late 1980s, at the International Consultation at Rhodos, she makes definitively and completely her break with Evdokimov, from now on developing a theology that opens the door for women's ordination. Calling into question the validity of a gender-based distribution of charisms, Elisabeth Behr-Sigel brings forth several arguments: each depiction of the Spirit as the hypostatic motherhood introduces sexuality in God; the biological differentiation of the sexes cannot be grounded on the distinction among the divine Trinitarian Persons; a male-only priesthood as an icon of Christ fails to notice that the priest acts not only *in persona Christi*, but also *in persona ecclesiae*; acting *in persona Christi*, the priest does not iconize Christ's maleness; Mary's virtues are not specifically feminine values or qualities, but charisms that should be embraced by all human persons, men and women.

After a brief exposition of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel's understanding of the female diaconate in the sixth chapter, the next chapter assesses to what extent "Eastern Orthodoxy's premier woman thinker" stands at the crossroad between Orthodox theology, Protestant tradition and secular feminist approaches. Given the fact that

contemporary Orthodox arguments against women ordination to the priesthood “revolve around three interconnected points: the nature of tradition, the nature of priesthood, and the nature of gender and priesthood” (p. 145), the last chapter of the book systematically presents the relevance of Behr-Sigel’s theological contribution to the current discussion on women ordination within the Eastern Orthodox Church. In this regard, Behr-Sigel’s insightful and critical contribution is three-fold: a) the enlightenment of ancient pagan societies, customs and traditions by Jesus’ Gospel is a very slow process, and it takes at least twenty centuries “to permeate relationships between men and women;” b) both men and women are images of Christ because the humanity of both have been assumed, restored and deified by the Logos; therefore, defending male-only priesthood on the basis of Christ’s maleness is in itself an objectionable argument; c) women are God’s images in their uniqueness as persons, and not in any particular set of feminine qualities.

Combining the historical approach with the systematic one, the originality of Sarah Hinlicky Wilson’s book lies without doubt in the fact that, assessing Elisabeth Behr-Sigel’s theology, it fills a gap in the literature about contemporary Orthodox debates on the possibility of women ordination, a phenomenon largely and rightly described as being more Western than Eastern. However, the reviewer would have liked to encounter in this book the author’s own critical assessment of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel’s reflections on woman place in the Church. Nevertheless, the same reviewer welcomes this book as a valuable instrument for all those interested in the debates on women ordination in the Orthodox Church, as for those preoccupied with the limits that have to be taken into account when Trinitarian theology is taken as model for anthropological or ecclesiological realities.

V. COMAN

Dominique REY. *Paroisses, réveillez-vous! Au défi de la nouvelle évangélisation*. Paris, Éd. de l’Emmanuel, 2012. (13×21), 278 p. ISBN 978-2-35389-192-4. €18.00.

Plutôt qu’une réflexion sur la paroisse en tant que telle, l’ouvrage de l’évêque de Toulon-Fréjus (depuis 2000), fournit un plaidoyer en faveur de la conversion missionnaire des communautés paroissiales, dans l’élan de la nouvelle évangélisation. S’appuyant sur les documents du Magistère produits depuis Vatican II, notamment sur l’expérience du Synode d’octobre 2012 consacré à la nouvelle évangélisation et la transmission de la foi auquel il a participé, et sur de multiples expériences menées dans son diocèse, ailleurs en France et à l’étranger, l’A. montre dans la première partie à quelles composantes dynamiques faire appel pour vaincre les résistances internes à la nouvelle évangélisation (p. 23-68). Il considère la paroisse plutôt comme une «communauté sacramentelle» que comme une «entité géographique» et défend ainsi la nécessité de constituer des «pôles missionnaires paroissiaux» regroupant plusieurs paroisses afin de pouvoir relever les défis de la proposition de l’Évangile aujourd’hui (p. 58-59 et 203-208).

Dans sa deuxième partie (p. 69-168), le livre dégage les «prérequis» de cette vision missionnaire des paroisses et les grands axes de sa mise en œuvre: une perspective ecclésiale de communion, une forte impulsion kérygmatische, une